Recommendations for Hosting, Supporting, and Managing Cvillepedia.com

Prepared for

Thomas Chapman and Sterling Howell
Albemarle Charlottesville Historical Society

By

Julian Brock, Lucy Hopkins, and Anna Sexauer
FCG Consulting

May 19, 2021
TABLE OF CONTENTS:

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 4

ANALYSIS OF CURRENT CONDITIONS 4

HIGH-NEED AREAS 4

Dead Links 4
Reference Errors 5
Unsourced Statements 5

CONTENT ANALYSIS 6

Business 6
Community Portal 7
Attractions 7
Business 8
Community Chronology 8
Education 9
Elections 9
Information Sources 10
Neighborhood Associations 11
Nonprofit Organizations 11
People of Interest 12

Current Events 12
Development and Government 13
History 13
Infrastructure 15
Lifestyle 16
Agriculture 17
Bakeries 17
Caterers 17
Grocery 17
Outdoor Markets 17
Pie 18
Restaurants 18
Media 18
Neighborhoods 18
People in Charlottesville-Albemarle 19
Sports 21

CURRENT CONTENT ANALYSIS SUMMARY AND OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS 21

LESSONS FROM OTHER LOCAL WIKIS 22

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR COMMUNITY--FOCUSED REBRANDING 24
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Albemarle Charlottesville Historical Society requested assistance with creating a strategy report for the newly acquired Cvillepedia. To that end, this report conveys research in best practices used in a variety of existing open-source, user-edited websites. To craft a strategic vision for the future of the site and to help identify the best role for Cvillepedia in the Albemarle community, the report bases recommendations on (1) An audit of Cvillepedia’s current information (2) Research into governing guidelines AND (3) exploration of potential partnerships for the website.

ANALYSIS OF CURRENT CONDITIONS

The analysis of current conditions includes a survey of both the technical errors on the website and an overall analysis of the content.

HIGH-NEED AREAS

Of the pages that currently exist, various technical problems need to be addressed. The problems involve dead links, reference errors, and articles with unsourced statements.

I. Dead Links

If an article has a dead link, it means the website used to cite information no longer exists or changed domain. Cvillepedia currently has 37 articles in need of updates to fix deadlinks. To find a list of pages with deadlinks, search “deadlink”, click on a page that includes deadlink, then scroll to the bottom to find “Articles with external links” listed in “Categories”. To fix deadlink problems, a user needs to find a website to source the information and replace the old link in the editing window.

Community Web Archive Program - Miranda Burnett Interview

To provide more stability, a method to preserve pages through external domain changes was explored. A meeting with Miranda Burnett, the librarian at the Jefferson-Madison Regional Library (JMRL), provided information about the application of a community web archive program to Cvillepedia.
JMRL recently received a grant to launch an archiving program and is currently working through the training process.

The program is a great opportunity to preserve Cvillepedia and a partnership should be pursued after the training is complete. The archive program fixes the deadlink problem by capturing website information and storing the pages in their own database. Even if domains change or pages get deleted, the content still exists in the archive and remains valid sources for citations. Even though Cvillepedia is updated frequently, JMRL can set up a program that updates periodically. Mrs. Burnett is still working through the training but believes a partnership with Cvillepedia will be relatively easy to start once the archiving begins.

II. Reference Errors

Reference errors exist when the citation for information is coded incorrectly. Errors can exist if a reference is listed but not cited at the bottom of the page, named the same as another reference, or from technical errors when coding the source.¹ There are currently 31 pages with reference errors. These pages can be found under maintenance. During a meeting with Michael Holroyd, he explained reference errors can easily be corrected by switching to editing mode to find the source and see the problem.

III. Unsourced Statements

Under current Cvillepedia policy, information that is a direct quote or likely to be challenged needs to be cited. If citations are not received, the editors will delete the reference.² Currently, 336 pages require sources for information. These pages can be found under the special pages tab. Fixing unsourced statements involves finding a source for the information and editing it into the page’s reference section.

¹ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Help:Cite_errors
² https://cvillepedia.org/Category:Articles_with_unsourced_statements
CONTENT ANALYSIS

When exploring Cvillepedia, information is filed under 12 portals. Portals are enhanced “Main Pages” for broad subjects that help researchers find articles associated with specific topics.\(^3\) Currently, Cvillepedia’s portals include Business, Cvillepedia Community Portal, Current Events, Development Government, History, Infrastructure, Lifestyle, Media, Neighborhoods, People in Charlottesville-Albemarle, and Sports. The following sections explore the current information included in each portal, pages in need of more information or creation, and recommendations for next steps.

1. Business

Content Analysis

Although Cvillepedia includes several businesses currently operating in Albemarle County, a comparison with the businesses listed by the chamber of commerce revealed several pages need to be added. The Charlottesville Regional Chamber of Commerce included the following categories of businesses.\(^4\) When cross-referenced against the businesses listed by the chamber of commerce, the number in parenthesis represents the number of businesses Cvillepedia does not include.

- Advertising and Media (39)
- Automotive and Marine (16)
- Agriculture, Fishing, and Forestry (6)
- Arts, Culture, and Entertainment (14)
- Construction → have 32 pages but Chamber lists 59
- Computers and telecommunications (24)
- Education (40)
- Finance and Insurance (116)
  - Cvillepedia includes 9 banks and 2 insurance firms
- Health Care (50)
- Home and garden (15)
- Lodging and travel (14/59)
- Manufacturing, Production, and Wholesale (5/13)
- Personal Services and care (22)
  - Some (very few) are listed
- Pets and vets (6)
- Real Estate, Moving, and Storage (8/86)

\(^4\) https://business.cvillechamber.com/list
Sports and recreation (14)

Recommendations

Although Cvillepedia is missing a considerable number of businesses, the list of current businesses is not desolate. In comparison to other portals, the business section is one of the topics that is in better shape and therefore should not be prioritized first when working on revamping the website. When work on the business portal begins, contacting the Charlottesville Regional Chamber of Commerce to form a partnership is recommended. The chamber of commerce can give information about businesses and pass information about Cvillepedia to business owners.

II. Community Portal

The community portal is designed to help website users find information about important organizations in the community. The portal includes the following categories: Attractions, business, community chronology, education, elections, information resources, libraries, neighborhood associations, non-profit organizations, and people of interest.

A. Attractions

Content Analysis

Of the information included under the subcategories, pages are representative of attractions in Charlottesville when compared to Visit Charlottesville.\(^5\) There are only a few gaps in information or places for improvement, which is promising in terms of completing this section of Cvillepedia.

Recommendations

When compared to information about attractions listed on Visit Charlottesville’s website as well as information the team thinks would be useful to include, Cvillepedia needs to add a few attractions and create additional subcategories. To complete the following subcategories, it is recommended pages be created for a few cemeteries, the Festy festival, and the Thomas Jefferson statue. The museum

\(^5\) [https://www.visitcharlottesville.org/things-to-do/attract]
subcategory is missing slightly more information and would be complete with the addition of pages detailing the Fralin, McGuffy Art Center, and the Kluge Ruhe Aboriginal Art Museum.

To include more information about attractions in Charlottesville, some subcategories should be added under this portal. Historical sites like Monticello and Montpelier are local destinations that have existing pages on Cvillepedia but should be linked under the attractions subcategory. Under the public spaces subcategory, it is recommended that Cvillepedia include popular trails and hikes in the area as that is a popular tourist attraction and pastime, especially during the pandemic. Finally, pages dedicated to golf courses and art galleries could be added to include even more options.

B. Business

The business category in the community portal includes information that currently does not exist under the separate business portal. It is recommended that the business subcategory be removed from the community portal and linked under the separate business portal instead to provide a comprehensive portfolio of businesses all in the same place.

C. Community Chronology

Content Analysis

After clicking on the community chronology subcategory, a user is taken to a page consisting of a long list of linked dates. If a user clicks on a specific date, they are then prompted to a page with additional links to either births or deaths of that year. Many of the links end in pages with little to no information on them. Additionally, the names included are mostly those of white Charlottesville residents.

Recommendation

To make the website more user-friendly, it is recommended to change the format of the community chronology page. Instead of listing all the dates with individual links to other pages, the chronology page should only link to one page for births and another for deaths. On these separate pages, the births and deaths should just be listed by year instead of linked so all information is in one place and thus easily accessible. In addition to making the site more user-friendly, this change will also eliminate
pages that include no information and show more clearly where additions need to be made. When making changes to this category, editors need to be more inclusive in the names of citizens being included. The list of births and deaths needs to be more representative of the Charlottesville community through the inclusion of non-white members. Records for African American resources in Virginia are documented on Family Search website. Additionally, it is recommended to contact Jean L. Cooper, manager of the Vital records collection at UVa, because the library has printed books that contain record information transcribed from courthouse records.

D. Education

The education page includes good coverage of the diversity and history of schools. Comprehensive lists of both public and private schools are included as well as history of African American schools. The listed schools include links to their individual websites, all of which are currently up to date. A potential problem with the education page is that relying on the schools’ websites for information may fail if the schools change their domain names.

E. Elections

Elections by Year

The elections by year subcategory contains extensive information about past elections but needs to be updated to include the most recent elections. Cvillepedia does not include any information about the 2020 candidates or election results, information that can be found on the Virginia Department of Elections website. A page for the 2021 local elections exists on Cvillepedia’s website but is not currently linked to the subcategory of elections, which can easily be updated.

Elected Officials

The elected officials subcategory includes information about a variety of offices but needs to be updated to reflect recent elections and changes. The current city council category needs to be updated to include Sena Magill, Michael Payne, and Lloyd Snook while moving Kathleen Galvin and Mike Signer’s
pages to a different category. The Albemarle Sheriff's page only lists two sheriffs’ whose terms expired. The Mayors of Charlottesville page includes no information, and the Scottsville Mayors category needs to be updated to include the current mayor. Overall, this category requires significant work updating the pages to reflect current elections and changes. A list of the current elected officials can be found on the Albemarle County website.

Candidates

The candidates for each election are linked under the elections by year page but can also be accessed through the candidates by office subcategory. Breaking down candidates by office is helpful but the various offices do not include all the candidates and are not ordered by date. To make this subcategory more efficient, it is recommended that the candidates for office be broken down by the year of the elections.

F. Information Sources

The information sources subcategory is a sparse source of information that has room for significant improvement. Currently, the only links include libraries, Cvillenews.com, and Monticello Avenue (Media). In the libraries subcategory, Cvillepedia is missing pages about the Gordon Avenue Library, all the UVa libraries, the VA Transportation Research Council Library, OZ, Little Free Library, the Jefferson Library, Central Library, and the Virginia Innovation Library. In addition to the missing page information, “Libraries” has a separate subcategory under the Community Portal that links to the same information.

The other pages listed under Information Sources are Cvillenews.com and Monticello Avenue Network. The Cvillenews page includes very little information about the platform but does include an active external link to the news outlet’s website. Monticello Avenue Network’s page includes more information about the project and has an active external link.

---

6 https://www.charlottesville.gov/677/City-Council
**Recommendation**

Although the information resources subcategory includes helpful information, the categories of information are already included under different subcategories. It is recommended that the libraries category exist in the separate subcategory alone instead of being listed under information resources. It is also recommended that the two media pages be moved from information resources to the subcategory “Media” that includes all the other media outlets. Because these subcategories are the only information under information resources and they should both be moved, it is recommended that the subcategory itself be deleted. The information in these categories can be found more easily through other routes so deleting this subcategory will make Cvillepedia more user friendly.

G. Neighborhood Associations

The pages dedicated to neighborhood associations provide brief information about the neighborhood location, creation of the association, and often lists the elected representatives. Of the existing pages, almost all the information about elected officials is at least five years old. The more recent officer information can be found on several homeowners associations’ websites. In addition to updates, this subcategory is missing pages for the Crozet Community Association, Four Seasons Patio Homes Association, Highlands at Mechums River Homeowners Association, Highlands Detached Homeowners Association, Hollymead Citizens Association, Key West Neighborhood Association, Lewis Mountain Neighborhood Association, and Little High Area Neighborhood Association. Additionally, a page for the Peacock Hill Community Association exists on Cvillepedia but is not linked under this subcategory.

H. Nonprofit Organizations

Cvillepedia currently includes an extensive list of nonprofits. All the pages include at least some information about the organizations, with some providing very detailed accounts of the organizations’ mission and activities. Because other areas of Cvillepedia need much more information added to be

---

7 https://www.avenue.org/communitygroups.htm#neighborhoods
comprehensive, it is recommended that the nonprofit organization subcategory not be prioritized during the updating process.

I. People of Interest

The people of interest category include links to pages ranging from pastors to elected officials to philanthropists. Cvillepedia has other categories dedicated to people commonly regarded as people of interest like elected officials, community leaders, and historic figures. The category also includes a link to people by businesses which lists a comprehensive list of categories people may fall into. This subcategory also includes links to pages for African American leaders, media biographies, politicians, and religious leaders but does not actually include content for people in these categories. It is recommended to add pages about people in these categories and include pages for other minority leaders to make Cvillepedia more diverse and inclusive.

III. Current Events

Content Analysis

The current events portal includes links to external sites like Charlottesville Tomorrow’s website, the daily progress, and local government calendars. These links are all up to date but do involve switching to another window. Although the information provided is helpful after some searching, Cvillepedia could be more efficient and community focused if it listed events directly on the website.

Recommendations

Cvillepedia should create a calendar or list community events directly on the website. Having a calendar directly on Cvillepedia provides an opportunity for rebranding to be more community focused and involved. Rather than have this page under a separate portal, the calendar should be on the main page of Cvillepedia. A main page location allows community members to discover the events more easily and could boost the use of Cvillepedia as a community resource.
IV.  Development and Government

The development and government portals are both comprehensive in the included pages. Sean Tubbs noted he adds a lot of journalism content related to government, so the coverage of this topic is consistent. Because other categories are missing much more information, it is recommended that the development and government portals not be prioritized.

V.  History

Content Analysis

Currently, the history pages on Cvillepedia are mainly organized by a long list of dates and a few subheadings highlighting the Civil War, historic preservation, and a few other seemingly random topics. Of those listed, 87 dates have no information included on their page. When looking at the long list of dates, research into different historical topics is difficult because of a general lack of knowledge about the start and end dates of specific events as well as the need to visit several different pages. A survey of the current information also shows a lack of diversity and inclusion of different groups in Charlottesville. For example, the Civil War page does not mention the role of African Americans during the war and includes very little information beyond significant dates.

Recommendations

The history category should be prioritized when working on Cvillepedia, especially given ACHS’s expertise in the area. Firstly, it is recommended the history page be organized by major periods and events rather than every individual date. This action will eliminate many empty pages, streamline information, and make researching specific events easier. In addition to the ACHS’s library, the UVa Special Collections includes extensive historical information about the history of Virginia and the history of archives at the University. The Civil War page and Early Charlottesville and County Residents pages would benefit from additional information about the history of non-White communities. Information about enslaved laborers and minority communities living in Albemarle County should be included. The Early Charlottesville and County Residents page could be a great place to include the history of the
Monacan people. Cvillepedia currently fails to include information about the tribe and Native American history and inclusion of these accounts would make Cvillepedia more holistic and accurate.

**Potential Partners**

The following list of organizations are local groups currently telling Albemarle County history. The groups serve as potential partners for contributing historical information from several different viewpoints.

- **Osher Lifelong Learning Institute (OLLI)/Bob Toplin**: OLLI at UVa provides educational opportunities and enrichment for adult community members. OLLI has over 1000 members and offers a wide variety of courses and engagement opportunities.\(^8\) OLLI is a promising partner because editing and creating pages on Cvillepedia could be mutually beneficial. Editing a website provides a new facet to OLLI’s education offerings and is a more extensive way to share interests and expertise with others. The senior community members that participate in this program are ideal Cvillepedia editors due to their responsibility, actual interest in historic preservation, and community involvement.

- **Madison House**: Madison House is the volunteer center for UVa students focusing on relationships with community partners.\(^9\) A community partnership with Madison House would provide student volunteers to work with ACHS on researching and editing Cvillepedia. ACHS would need to apply through the Madison House website to be considered for participation.

- **The Colonnade Club**: The Colonnade Club aims to create fellowship and community at UVa. With over 1000 members, the club hosts historical and community events and is headquartered in Pavilion VII on the Lawn. The Colonnade Club spearheaded a diverse and inclusive historical account of UVa to celebrate the Bicentennial. The information in this series would be beneficial

---


\(^9\) [https://www.madisonhouse.org/home](https://www.madisonhouse.org/home)
to include in Cvillepedia as it includes different accounts from a variety of voices and perspectives.10

- **UVa Guide Service**: The UVa Guides are a well-respected group at UVa working to tell a holistic story of life on Grounds. They offer historical tours and provide tours focused specifically on the history of African Americans and Women.11 A partnership with the Guides Program would help make Cvillepedia more inclusive and accurate in its historical accounts.

- **Dr. Alan Taylor**: Dr. Taylor is the Thomas Jefferson Chair in American History and author of *The Internal Enemy: Slavery and War in Virginia*, *Thomas Jefferson’s Education*, and others.12 Dr. Taylor’s expertise in Virginia history allows him to add and create reputable and diverse pages for Cvillepedia.

### VI. Infrastructure

The Infrastructure portal of Cvillepedia is separated into three categories: transportation, water supply, and public safety. All in all, the portal includes comprehensive information about various aspects of Charlottesville infrastructure and does not require significant updates.

**Transportation**

An area for improvement in the transportation category is the inclusion of private businesses like taxi services, limousines, and rental cars. The VisitCharlottesville website lists more than 50 private service options in Albemarle.13 A transportation category is also missing from the Business portal, but pages can be linked to both portals as they are added. If a section for private options is added, the transportation sub portal will be very comprehensive as it already includes a lot of information about public transportation, parking structures, infrastructure and projects, and transportation personnel.

**Water Supply**

---

10 https://www.colonnadeclubuva.com/club-history
11 https://www.uvaguides.org/specialty-tours/
12 https://history.virginia.edu/people/profile/ast8f
13 https://www.visitcharlottesville.org/plan/transportation/
The page dedicated to the water supply includes the basic information about Albemarle’s water supply source and includes links to learn more about the water and sewer authority. Information about the wastewater and water recovery is also included but does not go into detail about Rivanna's operations and its implications for Albemarle. It is recommended to add more specific information about the water supply and wastewater process, information detailed extensively on the Rivanna Authorities website. In addition to adding more information, it is recommended to also add a section to the page about drinking water and water quality. This information is also available on Rivanna’s website and is beneficial to add as a way to make Cvillepedia more informative for the community and its wellbeing.

Public Safety

Cvillepedia currently lists police, fire, and rescue services as the public safety organizations in Albemarle. Under this subcategory, the pages linked only include information about the various police forces serving Albemarle. Pages dedicated to the fire and rescue services operating in Albemarle exist on Cvillepedia but are currently not linked under this category. Updating the website and making the public safety category holistic involves simply editing the website to include the missing pages.

VII. Lifestyle

The lifestyle portal includes subcategories devoted to agriculture, bakeries, caterers, grocery, outdoor markets, pie, and restaurants. These categories are representative of the available options in Albemarle, but it is recommended to also add a subcategory for food trucks and coffee shops to be more inclusive of available options in the community. Because several pages need to be added detailing individual businesses and locations, it is recommended to contact organizations like the Downtown Business Association of Charlottesville and the Charlottesville Restaurant Association to encourage their members to create their own pages to simultaneously help build the community of Cvillepedia and publicity for their restaurants. Businesses can be encouraged to either become users and create their own page or submit information to the ACHS who can review the content then post it. It would save more time
for the restaurants to make the edits themselves but is more likely to be adopted if ACHS inputs
information that is submitted due to the time required to create an account and learn editing actions.

A. Agriculture

When compared to the VisitCharlottesville website, Cvillepedia includes more pages dedicated to
farms. The agriculture section is holistic in terms of both farms included and farm festivals and
associations. A minor recommendation is to add to this subcategory is the inclusion of pages dedicated to
community gardens and farm delivery services.

B. Bakeries

The bakery subcategory includes several local bakeries but needs additions to be complete. The
following bakeries need pages added under this subcategory: Albemarle Baking Company, MarieBette
Cafe and Bakery, Vivi’s Cakes and Candies, Bowerbird Bakeshop, Cake Bloom, Belle, Bee Conscious
Baking Co, Flour Power Cupcakery, Moon Maiden’s Delights and Wonderment Bakeshop and Creamery.

C. Caterers

The catering subcategory is missing many of the local catering companies. Agee’s Catering and
Concessions L’etoile Catering, and Harvest Moon Catering all have existing pages on Cvillepedia that just
need to be linked under this subcategory. Most other missing catering companies can be found by a
simple Google search and on the I love Charlottesville website.

D. Grocery

The grocery category includes information about several local grocery stores but lacks
information about major chains. Information about large grocery chains can easily be found so including
them in this subcategory is not an immediate priority and can be done later after more pressing edits get
completed.

E. Outdoor Markets

The outdoor markets section includes information about most major markets in Albemarle. It is
recommended to add a page for The Farmers Market at Ix to complete this subsection.
F. Pie

The pie subsection includes information about pie eating contests and pie festivals. This is an interesting category that could possibly be moved to a broader category about festivals given that there are only the two events listed. The Pie Chest and other places that make pie could also be added to this section if it remains a separate category to be more holistic but including them under restaurants or bakeries makes more sense.

G. Restaurants

The restaurant category is currently organized by Belmont restaurants, Downtown Mall restaurants, and restaurateurs while also including a list of linked pages at the bottom of the main page. The category currently includes over 100 local restaurants which is a significant portion of the existing businesses but not a complete list. The VisitCharlottesville website includes 295 restaurants and could be a good resource for comparing content. However, it is recommended to first contact the Charlottesville Restaurant Association to ask its members to contribute to their own pages as single handedly creating the content would be very time extensive. It is also recommended that the restaurants be separated by categories like family-friendly, cafes, fast food, fine dining, cultural options like Chinese and Thai food, diners, and bars.

VIII. Media

The media portal on Cvillepedia is one of the most comprehensive and up-to-date parts of the website. Sean Tubbs, active Cvillepedia contributor, is affiliated with the media and works diligently to upkeep the website’s media content. Of the various categories of media, four of the listed media outlets have pages with no information on them. Adding information to these existing pages does not require a significant investment of time and is recommended to complete the Media portal.

IX. Neighborhoods

Content Analysis
Cvillepedia is comprehensive in the pages dedicated to neighborhoods in Albemarle County but lacks substantive information on most pages. Of the 233 neighborhoods with pages, only 35 pages have at least some information on them while the remaining pages are blank.

Recommendations

The neighborhood portal needs significant contributions to be inclusive and up-to-date and therefore should be prioritized. When exploring neighborhoods, finding contacts for representatives of organizations and community groups was difficult due to the lack of formal and public organization. Jordy Yager’s Mapping Charlottesville project serves as a great potential partnership because it tells an inclusive and accurate history of neighborhoods.14 Mr. Yager’s extensive research into neighborhood and community groups is one of the only resources readily available and easily accessible. Additionally, the section about neighborhood organizations currently linked under the Community portal is recommended to be included under this portal instead to streamline information and make the website more user-friendly.

X. People in Charlottesville-Albemarle

The People in Charlottesville-Albemarle portal lists numerous linked categories to classify different people on the homepage. The first category is simply “people” and is a link to the same list as the “people of interest” in the community portal. The extensive list of possible categories of people provides a promising way to sort information, especially for new editors. Significant work needs to be done to complete this category in both a comprehensive and inclusive manner. It is recommended to pursue partnerships with the following organizations to help Cvillepedia achieve this goal.

- **Rotary Clubs**: The Rotary Club consists of members with many different backgrounds in business, history, and location. Many of the members are long-time Charlottesville residents and likely have access to information about the history and residents of Charlottesville.

14 https://mappingcville.com/2019/01/20/racial-covenants/
- Rotary Club of Albemarle [chapter]
- Blue Ridge Rotary [Club]

- **Gordonsville Lions Club**: Similar to the Rotary club, the Lions Club could be a great potential partner due to the mission of community service and local knowledge of community members. Helping update Cvillepedia is a great way for members to be active and contribute to a project while also still following social distancing and safety precautions. Contact information can be found using the following [link].

- **Jefferson School African American Heritage Center**: This organization works to honor and preserve the legacy of the African American Community in Charlottesville. It is recommended to partner with the Center due to their extensive knowledge and available resources. Cvillepedia currently lacks pages dedicated to African Americans in Charlottesville and needs to work with organizations like the Center to be more accurate.

- **The 100 Black Women of the Charlottesville Metropolitan Area**: 100 BWCMA advocates and promotes gender equity to build pathways of self-sustainability for women of African American descent. A partnership with this organization is recommended as Cvillepedia currently lacks strong representation of African American women in both historical accounts and current community leadership. Contact 100 BWCMA through their [website].

- **DAR Albemarle Chapter**: Through their mission of historic preservation and education, the members of the DAR are well equipped to be partners adding to both the history and people categories of Cvillepedia. Contact information is found [here].

- **Carter G. Woodson Institute for African-American and African Studies at the University of Virginia**: This organization administers undergraduate major and minor degrees in African American and African Studies and fellowship programs at UVa. It is recommended to contact [faculty members] in the department to request both help in documentation on Cvillepedia and additional resources to make the website more inclusive.
XI. Sports

The sports category includes information about athletic facilities, local sports leagues, public and private high school sports, and UVa athletics. The athletic facilities currently include pages for places to practice sports like fields and exercise classes like yoga. It is recommended to add more pages dedicated to local workout classes like Orange Theory and Purvelo to give users a broader range of the available exercise options in Albemarle. The sports leagues subcategory provides visitors information about the various organizations available to join in Albemarle. Albemarle County Public Schools created a comprehensive list of several additional exercise leagues available to join in the Albemarle area that should be added to the existing information on Cvillepedia. The state record pages for both private and public high schools do not currently include any information on the pages. However, it is recommended to make contributions to these pages after other categories missing more information receive attention.

CURRENT CONTENT ANALYSIS SUMMARY AND OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS

With more than 5,000 pages, Cvillepedia is large, and its content covers wide ranges of community information. The portals are in different stages of completeness and therefore some need to be prioritized over others when beginning to work on updating the website. Portals are designated into three categories: high, medium, and low need. Portals in high need require the addition of several pages and more information to become holistic, diverse, and inclusive. Pages in medium need still require the addition of pages but not as large-scale as high need. Portals deemed low need only need a few additional pages or have some minor recommended changes.

High Need Portals

Portals considered high need and thus should be prioritized when working on Cvillepedia include the community, history, and neighborhood portals. The community portal is considered in high need because it is an important way for Cvillepedia to be more community oriented and currently lacks a lot of information. Information for the subcategories of community chronology, elections, and information sources are in particular need. The history portal is also missing a lot of information and needs to be
reorganized to be more accessible. Having links to every year instead of organizing the section by eras and historical movements should be changed. Additionally, Cvillepedia needs to include more information about its diverse history and should prioritize adding pages that are representative of multiple perspectives and accounts. Finally, the neighborhoods portal should be prioritized because of the lack of information on the existing pages. Many of the listed pages include little to no information about the neighborhoods or the history of the area.

Medium Need

The portals considered medium need include business, current events, infrastructure, lifestyle, and sports. The business portal includes several of the existing businesses, but many are also missing. The current events portal is in medium need because it only includes links to external websites’ calendars. Cvillepedia would benefit from including this information directly on the website, preferably on the main page to help the website be more community oriented. The infrastructure portal is mostly complete but requires the addition of pages dedicated to the several available private transportation options as well as a little more information about the water supply and wastewater services. The lifestyle portal is considered in medium need because information needs to be added to the various subcategories to make them complete. Finally, the sports page falls in this category because Cvillepedia would benefit from adding more information about community leagues and local gyms.

Low Need

The portals that are considered low need should not be prioritized when starting work on Cvillepedia. Many of these portals are mostly complete in their current state and only require some minor additions and changes. Development, government, and the media portals are all considered in low need.

LESSONS FROM OTHER LOCAL WIKIS

Several other communities document their history and culture through wikipedia-like pages. Some pages are separate entities like Cvillepedia and Pensapedia, the page covering Pensacola, Florida. There is also a large group of pedias joined in a collaborative project called LocalWiki that uses the same
software to build websites of varying size for over 100 locations.\textsuperscript{15} Information about localities like Davis, California and Tallahassee, Florida use the same software for their websites but include different content on their pages. The following information includes recommendations and information sourced from other, similar community websites.

**Pensapedia**

Pensapedia is a wiki page similar in content and design to Cvillepedia. An aspect from Pensapedia that can be applied to Cvillepedia is the categorization of people of interest. Earlier in the report, a discussion around the definition of people of interest was raised because Cvillepedia includes this as a subcategory of the community portal. Pensapedia also includes a “people” page and includes many categories currently not present on Cvillepedia. As Cvillepedia continues to add content, it is recommended to adopt the following categorizations included on Pensapedia: artists, historians, media, and namesakes.

**Davispedia**

Davispedia is one of the largest local wikis and is dedicated to documenting the local community of Davis, California. The LocalWiki project began with Davispedia and the website's founders, Philip Neustrom and Mike Ivanov, expanded the project to include several other localities across the United States and in different countries.\textsuperscript{16} It is recommended to contact the founders for feedback about website growth, funding opportunities, and community guidelines to take advantage of their expertise and experience.

After exploring the Davispedia page, it is recommended Cvillepedia adopt several aspects of their website. Firstly, the Davispedia page includes a page dedicated to fundraising. On this donation page, the administrators outlined the reasons the page needs donors, how to donate, and lists past contributors and yearly sums.\textsuperscript{17} The Davispedia organizers also put on a “fundraising party extravaganza” with music,

\textsuperscript{15} https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/LocalWiki
\textsuperscript{16} https://localwiki.org/about/
\textsuperscript{17} https://localwiki.org/davis/Donate
food, and an auction. An event like this could help Cvillepedia not only raise money, but also spread awareness about the intentions of the website, the new ownership, and the community rebranding.

Davispedia also included information that made the page more community focused. On their main page, Davispedia includes links to pages for community alerts like petitions, an events calendar, and a featured page. Finally, Davispedia gives users a forum to write reviews about restaurants and businesses. Adopting pages like these will also help Cvillepedia become more community focused.

**Tallahassee Wiki**

The Tallahassee community website included several aspects that made the website more community focused and could easily be incorporated into the Cvillepedia page. The Tallahassee editing group hosts a regular monthly gathering like “Wine and Wiki” to encourage a community within the editors and create content together. Cvillepedia would benefit from hosting an event like this because content creation could be spread more evenly among editors while spreading the word about the website. Other community aspects the Tallahassee website links on their main page include social movements, streets, social services, food trucks, worship, volunteering, health resources, environment/sustainability, blogs and social networks, Wi-Fi hotspots, nightlife, and music and bands. Including similar links would help Cvillepedia be more community focused because residents would be able to better connect with each other and know more about the events happening in town.

**RECOMMENDATIONS FOR COMMUNITY--FOCUSED REBRANDING**

To make Cvillepedia more community-focused, it is recommended to adopt practices from other local wikis and make several changes. Several of these changes are mentioned in earlier sections of the report and the following information summarizes and adds on to the existing information. The main landing page of Cvillepedia has a lot of potential to become a community resource for events, activities,

18 https://localwiki.org/davis/Davis_Wiki_Wacky_Woo_1
19 https://localwiki.org/davis/
20 https://localwiki.org/tallahassee/
21 ibid
and movements. It is recommended that the main page include a calendar of community events or a list of upcoming events that month. This could include festivals, park events, community organization meetings, town halls, and many other events. The main page could also include information about community alerts, social movements, and voting information during elections. Another way to make the page more community focused is adding places to leave reviews of restaurants and services so people can interact with each other and the businesses. Providing walking tour maps and information about ways to explore the community will help visitors more easily explore Albemarle and provide more opportunities for activities to do. Finally, including information and links to community members personal blogs, social media, and other personal projects is recommended to highlight community members and how they spend their time.

DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION

During the audit of Cvillepedia, several areas of the website were found to lack information that was representative of the community as a whole. Neighborhoods in Charlottesville have historically been problematic in terms of gentrification and representation and it is important for Cvillepedia to accurately account the history of these neighborhoods and groups. A great resource for both information and aid is Jordy Yager of the Mapping Cville project. Information about historical inequities in Albemarle as well as contact information can be found on the project’s website. Another area requiring major improvements is the people category. Currently, the majority of the pages dedicated to citizens of Albemarle are about white men. Although categories dedicated to African Americans exist, no actual pages are linked under them. There is also very little representation of women and other minority groups. Like the history recommendation, it is recommended to pursue several potential partnerships representing various voices in the community.

Meeting with Siri Russell

A team member met with Siri Russell, Director of Diversity and Inclusion in Albemarle County, to discuss ways to make Cvillepedia more representative of the Albemarle community. During the
meeting, Ms. Russell said what stood out to her most now was the lack of information on the website. She also noted it would be difficult to audit the information in its current state but would be happy to serve as a resource moving forward as pages are added. For the history section, she mentioned it is important to include sources of information from different perspectives. Currently, the main editors of Cvillepedia are mainly white, middle aged men. It is recommended to diversify the source of edits by reaching out to other community organizations and representatives. In the history section above, many of the recommended community partners will be able to help add different perspectives. Ms. Russel also noted that the neighborhood pages need more information and should be sensitive to wording used to describe neighborhoods, like incorporated and unincorporated.

FUNDING RESEARCH

Research into grants and other sources of funding for Cvillepedia was conducted but will need to be expanded upon as the website grows. A main recommendation for funding is to add a link on the main landing page that routes visitors to a donation platform. Similar to Wikipedia, including a write-up explaining Cvillepedia’s purpose of serving the community and volunteer-based information source is recommended to encourage donations. Taking a lesson from Davispedia, Cvillepedia should also create a page dedicated to the donors of the website. The page thanks the donors and mentions how much funds have been raised. Davispedia also hosts a yearly fundraising party extravaganza which could be a good way for Cvillepedia to raise money and awareness about the website in the local community.

Because the Davispedia founders help start and build hundreds of other local wikis, they qualified for a grant through the Knight Foundation. The Knight Foundation has worked with Charlottesville Tomorrow in the past and could be a potential source for future funds. It is recommended to contact the Davispedia founders, whose emails are linked earlier in the report, to learn about their grant application process and if Cvillepedia can receive funding through their existing grant.
RECRUITMENT AND RULES: MOTIVATING AND GOVERNING USERS ON CVILLEPEDIA

I. General Lessons from Wikipedia

*What Cvillepedia Can Implement and Expect?*

Cvillepedia will need to be relatively realistic about the number of users that will be consistently active on the site. A target should be set of having at least five users available to respond to questions and concerns, requests for feedback, and monitor recent edits to the site. This will keep the site relatively active to the amount of information on it and the size of the community that will be using and relying upon it.

A sustainable model that considers the number of users that will be active may be to only accept new users during certain periods of time to minimize the chances of bots and individuals with malicious intent gaining access to the site. This could take the form of Wiki events put on by the historical society a few times a year that help train volunteers, sign them up for the site, and orient them to useful features and opportunities. Another model that could be adopted is attaching auxiliary events to already existing events that focus on historical topics, politics, etc. Auxiliary events could provide people a place to put information into Cvillepedia and receive assistance and feedback immediately. The most successful events will be ones where volunteers conduct research before the event and come to it ready to write up information or simply input something already created into the site. These events could be organized to allow access to library resources and other information sources before the event occurs. These types of events will likely take around two hours to complete with most individuals finishing tasks within the first hour. Cvillepedia’s goal should be to implement some effective Wikipedia practices but simplifying them for a smaller and less consistently involved population of users and volunteers. Easing technology barriers and providing opportunities to research and input information into the site will allow for the greatest number of involved volunteers and the proliferation of information on the site.

II. Settling Disputes and Monitoring Content

*Vandalism*
The most effective way to monitor problems associated with vandalism is to vet new users and maintain a group of volunteers that check a page that details recent edits. Often edited pages can generate emails or notifications to people very active on the site which can allow for swift actions to be taken if needed to remedy vandalism or other inappropriate actions taken related to a page’s content.

*Editing Debates*

Based upon high-profile examples of disputes in Wikipedia, for example the Church of Scientology and critics of the organization, oftentimes users on both sides need to be reprimanded or addressed in some way to maintain the neutrality of the site. Disagreements between users over page edits should never be decided by one person. Instead, all issues should be addressed in forums where many other users are present and input from all sides can be given in fair space. Forums or notice boards should exist for different types of disputes. Given the smaller size of Cvillepedia, there will be a smaller number of users contributing to decisions and settlement of disputes. Even with a smaller number of players transparency, fairness, and involving as many people as possible should be goals kept in mind. Debates should end with a vote taken by all individuals who oversaw arguments made by both sides.

A particularly concerning debate that can emerge is when a person alleges targeting or harassment online amid disputes about recent edits to pages. This can be a difficult defense to deal with when a person is making biased or inaccurate edits to a page. But a system built on transparency and collaboration among many users can withstand disingenuous arguments related to this topic. At the same time, harassment and equity complaints should be considered with seriousness when first proposed.

*Controversial Pages*

Wikipedia locks certain pages that contain topics that are contentious and would normally be subject to a high volume of edits. These involve many political pages as well as biographies of living persons. Special permission must be granted to edit these pages by designated individuals who are elected to positions (explained further in next section). Pages that would warrant this monitoring in Cvillepedia include
Confederate monument pages as well as politics-related pages. This policy should be used sparingly to preserve accessibility, but this tool should remain in the back pocket of administrators as the site develops and adds users.

III. Building Community and Structuring Going Forward

Recruiting and Motivating Volunteers

Volunteers make sites like Wikipedia and Cvillepedia function day-to-day and are integral for completing a variety of tasks including uploading information, editing pages, settling disputes, approving new users, and creating a collaborative space. Cvillepedia should seek to foster a coherent social community that is both virtual, but also physical since it has the advantage of being rooted in a small, tight-knit community. Through online spaces like a Slack channel and Zoom meetings to a transition to in-person events associated with ACHS as well as stand-alone events, Cvillepedia can create and motivate an involved pool of volunteers by promoting people’s desire for knowledge building, inquiry, practice, culture and socialization, and counseling or development (Baytiyeh and Pfaffman, 2010).

Cvillepedia ultimately seeks to be an online encyclopedia where people in the community can go to access relevant local information about Charlottesville that may not otherwise be easily accessible. Emphasizing the creation of a shared source that holds community memories and information can motivate individuals to engage in many ways with the site. This speaks to the importance of making the site accessible to as many people as possible to allow for people around the Charlottesville area to share extremely localized and context specific information. People often derive joy from creating a product that others will experience.

Inquiry and curiosity often can drive people to get involved with an activity or organization. Helping individuals who interact with the site and contribute to it achieve a state of flow where someone gets lost in an activity and loses self-awareness can promote better experiences with the site while also helping to achieve of goal of bringing people to the site for one reason and encouraging them to spend more time doing other activities as well. For someone to achieve a state of flow a person needs a clear set
of goals, feedback, control over what they do, and an ample amount of time. Seeking out volunteers who meet some of these criteria while also providing others through maintenance of the site will encourage people to return and continually be involved.

Finally, promoting a social and collaborative element in Cvillepedia will help to satisfy the needs and wishes of many volunteers. Social factors that can motivate an individual include increasing one’s reputation, the principle of reciprocity (people support community), efficacy, and commitment to a group. Strengthening virtual and physical bonds between people and tying Cvillepedia to physical places in and around Charlottesville will create a sense of community leading to success for the site.

A study of Wikipedia volunteers in 2010 found that many contributed to the site for several reasons that match with principles and ideas expressed in this section. Volunteers cited altruism, sharing knowledge, reverting vandalism, and creating a well-respected resource as some of the main reasons for their involvement (Baytiyeh and Pfaffman, 2010). As ACHS takes over the operation of Cvillepedia, works to recruit volunteers, and connects with other community organizations these principles should be kept in mind and executed in concrete terms to promote a pool of involved volunteers.

Balancing Democracy and Functionality- Hierarchical Structuring

Wikipedia runs the fine line between a democracy and oligarchy in its structure and functions. The site can be edited by any individual user but with such a large body of information and large group of volunteers some hierarchy in titles and power is needed to keep the site functioning and address time-sensitive tasks. Wikipedia has two hierarchical elements that balance the low barrier to entry to participate in Wikipedia with the site’s functionality.

The first are elected editors. The titles of editors range from being associated with specific projects, topics, or pages to being general administrators. These individuals rarely use their special distinction to override other contributors’ efforts. Instead, these distinctions signal an individual who is extremely involved in contributing to Wikipedia and is committed to the upkeep and quality of certain pages or the site as a whole. These roles are usually voted on by all volunteers but last for several years.
Cvillepedia could seek to implement a similar system focused on promoting voices from various neighborhoods in Charlottesville as well as pertinent local topics that require large amounts of research or expertise in some field.

The second element is an elected board that manages the main elements of the site. In Wikipedia this used to consist only of the founder Jimmy Walsh, but it expanded to at least seven members. Members of this board of trustees respond to time-sensitive issues relating to hurtful vandalism and content as well as material on biographies of living persons among other administrative tasks. Cvillepedia will need to implement this structure to approve new users to the site, train volunteers, and monitor content. A few very involved volunteers will be needed to allow the Cvillepedia to grow in content and support volunteers, but these board members must always remember the limited scope of their authority and the nature of their distinction. However, far fewer people are needed to carry out administrative duties than expected, as evidenced by Wikipedia functioning with only 488 active administrative accounts. Board members may be the ones to approve of new users to the site and quickly deal with the fallout from problematic edits, but in general their role should be one of mediation and administrative support to foster a community of users who operate at the same level.

IV. Administrators and Bureaucrats

Current User and Moderator Status

Currently, there are 2,433 registered users, 10 active users that performed actions in the last 30 days, 10 administrators, and 9 bureaucrats. Administrators have access to restricted technical features like deleting pages and blocking users. Bureaucrats are granted the same access but are also able to add and remove administrators. Despite the existence of multiple administrators and bureaucrats, Sean Tubbs and Brian Wheeler are responsible for most to all moderation.

Michael Holroyd Interview

---

23 https://cvillepedia.org/Administrators
Michael Holroyd is a Cvillepedia user that assisted in transforming the old website to be more user friendly and easier to edit. When discussing the website, he noted that becoming an administrator and bureaucrat is more about the personal interest a user has in pages and upkeep rather than the official title itself. After his recent changes, editing the website is much easier so training people to use the website to make changes and edits is no longer necessary.

Recommendations

After research into Wikipedia’s policy, it is recommended to adopt the same definitions and guidelines for administrators and bureaucrats. Wikipedia defines administrators as users with “the ability to block and unblock user accounts, IP addresses, and IP ranges from editing, edit fully protected pages, protect and unprotect pages from editing, delete and undelete pages, rename pages without restriction, and use certain other tools.” Users are able to request or be nominated for adminship if they meet nomination standards. Nomination standards for Wikipedia require having an account for more than 30 days and making 500 edits. Because Cvillepedia is a smaller website, lowering the number of edits required to become an administrator could encourage more participation from users. Requiring a user to make 250 or 300 edits before being allowed nomination would still be a large goal to work towards but may be more easily obtainable. Wikipedia also details a nomination process in which a candidate’s nomination remains open for seven days to give all users the opportunity to ask questions, state opinions, and make comments. An open forum process like Wikipedia’s is recommended because it allows more community involvement in decision making processes. Because the candidate’s edits are public and traceable, evidence towards their credibility and fit as an administrator is not difficult to attain. After the open forum period is over, bureaucrats review all comments to gauge community consensus.

26 ibid
Comments in opposition and support are counted, and candidates that received 75% supportive comments pass to become administrators.\(^{28}\)

Wikipedia’s process for becoming a bureaucrat is identical to that of becoming an administrator with the only difference being an 85% approval requirement.\(^ {29}\) Cvillepedia could also require the user to make more edits than the minimum expectation for administrators to further distinguish the positions and ensure continued commitment to the website. Adopting a community consensus-based approval system will help rebrand Cvillepedia to be more community focused and eliminate the possibility of all major decisions being made by an exclusive group of people.

V. **Summary and Recommendations for Recruitment and Rules**

A small but robust group of volunteers will be needed to keep the site up to date and to engage with registered and periodic users. Specific numerical goals should be set as the user-base and content on the site increase. A current attainable goal should be five volunteers who check the site weekly to answer questions, approve new users, monitor content, and work to settle disputes. These involved users can have expansive access to the site, but they should not wield this power to shut down activity of less-involved users so that the site remains open and accessible to anyone who wishes to engage with good faith. This philosophy should be upheld through the activities and events held to recruit volunteers and aid users in becoming more engaged with the site and adding content. Balancing functionality with a model of equality between users will help to keep volunteers engaged in the Cvillepedia community and create a secure future for the site.

**PARTNERSHIPS AND CHALLENGES MOVING FORWARD**

I. **Overall Summary and Recommendation**

After discussions with professionals involved in digital preservation and volunteer

\(^{28}\) ibid

coordination, it is apparent that there are several action items which must be completed to ensure the longevity of Cvillepedia. According to these professionals, the maintenance of this site depends on Cvillepedia having a permanent domain, a permanent project lead, a pass-down document for site maintenance, a steady supply of volunteers, and the accessibility of coding for the site, which will determine the difficult of site transitions as certain styles (i.e., html, xml, etc.) go in and out of fashion. ACHS should prioritize meeting the aforementioned needs of the site as they move forward.

II. Proposed Partnerships

A. Albemarle Charlottesville Historical Society (ACHS)

Contacted Sterling Howell. The group is already involved in the work and willing to help long-term, especially with volunteer coordination.

B. Jefferson-Madison Regional Library (JMRL)

Contacted David Plunkett. The group is already involved in the work and interested in helping coordinate volunteers and also host the cvillepedia domain. They are understaffed at the moment and cannot commit to more at this time but want to be an active partner moving forward.

C. Jefferson School African American Heritage Center (JSAAHC)

Contacted Jordy Yager. At the time of the email (early March), he was unable to take on additional projects. It could be worthwhile to swing back later, as Yager is a specialist in digital humanities.

D. City of Charlottesville

Contacted Brian Wheeler, Cvillepedia co-founder and Charlottesville Director of Communications. No space for government work in this sector. Unlikely to get government employees or government funding to help with Cvillepedia maintenance. Potential to use Cvillepedia as a link for the City’s website to expand upon historical information, example being a link to the Historic Resources Committee.

E. Albemarle County

Contacted general email and did not receive a reply. Unclear which portion of the country could feasibly partner with help with Cvillepedia. Some work underway linking
information from Cvillepedia to the County’s web page for the Historic Preservation Committee.

III. Potential Subsidiary Partnerships

F. University of Virginia.

Spoke to Worthy Martin, head of the Jefferson’s University Early Life (JUEL) commission for UVA’s Institute for Public Humanities (IPH). Will have an IPH intern this summer; could potentially have more IPH interns in following summers. Could reach out to Louis Nelson at UVA; Nelson is Vice Provost for Academic Outreach. He focuses on community engagement and public service, and he would be the right person to speak to about creating a relationship between UVA and Cvillepedia.

G. Albemarle and Charlottesville Schools.

Mixed responses to the idea of reaching out to K-12 schools. Fairly steep learning curve to creating posts, and a bit of a liability to let younger students become contributors unless very closely organized. Instead of viewing students as long-term users, should explore connecting teachers with Cvillepedia to sue for education modules for students.

H. Historic preservation organizations.

Spoke to Robert Dewberry, head of volunteer programs at Monticello. Monticello is unlikely to partner with Cvillepedia, but Dewberry passed on pertinent information about volunteer groups and volunteer recruitment.

1. Target older people for volunteers
2. Reach out to UVA students through department-specific listservs
3. Cville Weekly or Daily Progress might run free ads on the back cover

I. Community organizations

CAAVA (through United Way), which is a local volunteer organization. Contact Anne Porter (aporter@unitedwaytja.org) to discuss volunteer solicitations. They have the
equivalent of a job board for volunteers; this could be a good place to find long-term volunteer contributors.

IV. Challenges of Maintenance

There are two main categories of challenge of maintaining digital preservation: technological and sociological issues. Technologically, the plainer technology project creators use, the easier it is to maintain the site. Cvillepedia’s recent switch to a more user-friendly technology will ease contributions and should prove beneficial for improving longevity. An additional, integral challenge to digital preservation is to ensure that there is someone who will need to maintain the domain. According to Worthy Martin, the Institute for Advanced Technology in the Humanities (IATH) could potentially provide that.

Importantly, the founders and maintenance team should create a pass-down document. This document will include all information about the site: their typical activity on the site, rules that apply to content, the technological set-up of the site, etc. It will be important to document every aspect of the site’s current function to ease pass-down. If maintenance of the site or daily functions change throughout Cvillepedia’s lifespan, the documentation should be changed to reflect that.

Finally, it will be important to find a long-term sociological home for Cvillepedia. Will ACHS be the permanent home of Cvillepedia? If ACHS cannot commit to that, leaders of Cvillepedia should reach out to the aforementioned potential partners. Cvillepedia also needs a dedicated project lead who can commit to its maintenance; this person’s main job should be to oversee the daily operations and long-term arc of the site.